

BEFORE THE MASTERTON DISTRICT COUNCIL

IN THE MATTER OF the Resource Management Act 1991
AND an application for resource consent for the demolition of the
Masterton Town Hall located at 64 Chapel Street, Masterton
Application Number: RM240135
APPLICANT Masterton District Council

**MINUTE #2 OF INDEPENDENT HEARING COMMISSIONER
DATED 25 MARCH 2025**

1. On Monday 24 March 2025 the following emails were referred to me:
 - Email dated 21 March 2025 from Submitter 58 (Simon Byrne); and
 - Email dated 23 March 2025 from Lyn Riley on behalf of Submitter 33 (Masterton Ratepayers & Residents Association).

Copies of both emails are attached.

2. Both submitters have challenged the accuracy of the cost calculations provided in the Applicant's documentation.
3. The matters raised are of sufficient concern that I direct the Applicant to provide an appropriate written reply as part of its evidence to be filed by 4.00pm on Friday 28 March 2025.

Correspondence

4. Any correspondence relating to this Minute should be directed to Sheryn Scanlan, Planning Technical Support Officer at planningadmin@mstn.govt.nz and I will endeavour to respond as soon as I can.



Alistair Aburn
Independent Hearing Commissioner

25 March 2025

From: Simon Byrne
Sent: Friday, 21 March 2025 6:35 PM
To: Admin Planning <planningadmin@mstn.govt.nz>
Subject: Re: RM240135 - Masterton Town Hall - Planning Officer's s42A Report

Hello, I have noticed a significant error in the costs provided in the applicants information, notably an arithmetic error shown in the attachment. The error is made by RPS in their costings report.

I request that the independent commissioner sees this email and asks the applicant to review the cost information and provides a correction ahead of the hearing? This may also affect various statements made about the costs of the various options.

Simon Byrne

Masterton Civic Facility

Town Hall and Municipal Buildings

Option 1 – Demolish Town Hall and Municipal building

Demolition of Existing Townhall, Municipal Building	2,825	m2	711	2,009,900
New Build – Town Hall	1,085	m2	5,570	14,206,884
New Build – Municipal Building	1,740	m2	5,100	8,552,100
External Works	1	Item	392,870	392,870
External Services	1	Item	310,000	310,000
SUB-TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COST	5,651	m2	3,120	17,630,220



Request for a Costings Review of the Town Hall Project

Good Afternoon,

There is a significant arithmetic error in the cost calculations provided by RPS in their report for the Town Hall project (pg 18 of 30), as outlined in the attached document. This mistake could mislead the public and may impact statements regarding the cost comparison between retaining the Municipal Building and constructing a new build. Specifically, the claim that retaining the Municipal Building is 50% more expensive than a new build no longer holds when accounting for the missing \$8M and should be subject to an Auditor General’s investigation. I request that the independent commissioner be advised of this error and review this email, ask the applicant to correct the cost information, and ensure the revised figures are provided to the Commissioner before the hearings. The demolition process of this heritage building needs to be put on hold until the revised figures have been recalculated and consulted on with the public.

Regards

Lyn Riley - President, Masterton Ratepayers & Residents Assn



Summary

Description	Quantity	Unit	Rate	Total (NZD)
Masterton Civic Facility				
Town Hall and Municipal Buildings				
Option 1 – Demolish Town Hall and Municipal building				
Demolition of Existing Townhall, Municipal Building	2,825	m2	711	2,009,900
New Build – Town Hall	1,085	m2	5,570	14,206,884
New Build – Municipal Building	1,740	m2	5,100	8,552,100
External Works	1	Item	392,870	392,870
External Services	1	Item	310,000	310,000
SUB-TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COST	5,651	m2	3,120	17,630,220
Preliminaries	15.0	%		2,644,533
Margin	8.0	%		1,621,980
SUB-TOTAL CONSTRUCTION (INCL. P&G, MARGIN)	5,651	m2	3,875	21,896,733
Construction Contingency	25.0	%		5,474,183
TOTAL CONSTRUCTION (INCL. CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY)	5,651	m2	4,844	27,370,916
Professional Fees	17.0	%		4,653,056
Authority Fees, Long Service Levy, Other Costs	2.5	%		684,273
Client Costs				Excluded
TOTAL PROFESSIONAL FEES	5,651	m2	944	5,337,329
TOTAL PROJECT COST EXCLUDING ESCALATION	5,651	m2	5,788	32,708,245
Escalation	6.0	%		1,962,495
TOTAL PROJECT COST	5,651	m2	6,135	34,670,739
				\$ 43,222,839
Assumptions				
The removal of asbestos as identified in the Firesafe NZ report of May 2019				
Identification and removal of soil contaminated with diesel including reinstatement with hardfill. The assumed volume is 857m3 and this is based on an allowance of 500mm depth across the gross building area				
We have assumed that these works will not be staged.				
We have assumed that no decanting of existing furniture, and the like is required and will be completed prior to works commencing.				

3 CONCLUSION / RECOMMENDATION

3.1 Conclusion & Next Steps

RPS have undertaken a high-level measured approach to the cost plan to establish the value of the anticipated scope of works required (Refer to Appendix A).

Due to the limited information available at this early stage of the projects, the estimates completed are based on the available data and assumptions listed. As the design matures, it is anticipated that the cost plan will develop, allowing for a robust cost and change control process. RPS also recommend that the project team continues to identify, assess, monitor, and mitigate project risks.

The total development cost of the options is as below:

Options	Total Development Cost (NZD) (excl. GST)
Option 1 - Full Demolition of Town Hall and Municipal Building.	\$ 34,670,739.00
	+ 8,552,100 = 43,222,839.00
Option 2a - Partial Demolition - Retention of the Municipal Building and demolition of the Town Hall.	\$ 52,044,526.00
	Difference = 20%
Option 2b - Partial Demolition - Retention of the Municipal Building Façade only.	\$ 38,313,138.00
Option 3 - Decommissioning and mothballing the Town Hall and Municipal Building.	\$ 6,083,681.00
Option 4a - The buildings will be strengthened to 80% NBS.	\$ 30,321,872.00
Option 4b - The buildings will be strengthened to 34% NBS.	\$ 27,239,271.00